POSTGRADUATE MEDICAL EDUCATION

SCHULICH SCHOOL OF MEDICINE & DENTISTRY

RESIDENT AND TRAINEE SELECTION GUIDELINES TO PROMOTE EQUITY, DIVERSITY AND INCLUSION (EDI)

Reviewed by PGME Committee: December 14, 2022
Date of Next Scheduled Review: December 2023

Programs should:

- Showcase the diversity of current and former residents, fellows, faculty and the community through their website and program promotional materials.
- Emphasize an atmosphere that is truly welcoming to a diverse community of applicants.

The Schulich Medicine and Dentistry diversity and inclusion statement is available here.

File Review:
- Use a structured file review process with a standardized rubric that reflects the desired qualities of the applicant and a minimum of two independent reviewers.
- Consider that personal statements are non-standardized and highly subjective when providing weighting in the rubric. Consider identifying personal statements that are centred on patient care, rather than 'me' or 'taker' focused, in the evaluation.
- Consider including factors such as: evidence of leadership, community outreach, volunteer work, extracurricular activities, research and scholarly projects, work experience, letters of recommendation, Medical Student Performance Record (MSPR) and evidence of interest in the specialty (with the caveat that elective opportunities are not equally available for all students) in the rubric.

Interviews: (see Appendix 1 for Information about validity and reliability.)
- Conduct interviews in a virtual-only format for all applicants. Do not use 'hybrid' interviews.
- Interview Invitation:
    - Provide information about the interview structure (i.e., how long, the interview panel, approximate number of questions, having follow-up questions, etc.)
    - Provide reassurance about any potential technical difficulties, and a phone number to text for any assistance or last-minute questions, etc.

Access to accommodations:
- Incorporate the following statement into program interview information provided to applicants: "Persons with disabilities who anticipate needing accommodation for any part of the residency (or fellowship or AFC trainee) application may contact, in confidence, Learner Experience." This statement is on the PGME Virtual Interview Preparation website. While the same language should be used, the statement can be modified slightly to refer to residency applications vs. fellowship applications, etc.

Mitigation of selection bias:
- Implicit bias training is strongly recommended for all individuals on the interview team. Appendix 2 provides available resource mitigation bias.
- Check for conflict of interests for all involved in the file review and interview process.

Logistics:
- See the [PGME virtual interview website](#) for more information.
- Do not record the interview.
- It is suggested that the chat function be disabled to prevent "side conversations".

The Interview Team:
- Consider including the Program Administrator, a Nurse Practitioner, Charge Nurse, or other health care worker closely associated with the program on the panel.
- Ensure that there is resident representation.
- Consider two or three interview teams of 2-3 individuals each.
- Interviewers should provide their own independent scoring of interview responses; it should not be a 'group think'.
- Ensure that interviews are not rushed and break time is available for the interview panels. For larger programs, schedule interviews over multiple days to avoid 'Zoom fatigue' where possible.

Introductions:
- Provide a warm welcome with introductions of the interview team members.
- Tell the applicant how long the interview will take and what the format will be.
- Let the applicant know you may be taking notes to ensure you are able to remember their responses.
- Let the applicant know the interview will not be recorded, and that your expectation is that the applicant will not be recording any component of the interview.
- Provide reassurances and a back-up phone number for administrative staff as a precaution if there are technical difficulties, and details around what the back-up process will be.

Questions:
- Interviews should be structured with standardized questions and a defined rating scale.
- Questions should be job related, using behavioral or situational questions (see Appendix 3 for information on behavioral and situational questions).

Consider:
- Time zones when scheduling interview for applicants
- Blinded or semi-blinded interviews (i.e., providing interviewers with only applicant names and without the applicant file ahead of the interview)
- Providing applicants with a standardized background to use, and using the same background for the interview team
- Using pronoun pins for all interviewers
- Closed captioning for Zoom interviews as a routine practice

Avoid:
- Evaluating the applicant based on a first impression, and a 'halo' effect.
- Contrasting applicants with each other. Try to rate each applicant individually (the order of interviews may affect ratings).
- Providing any feedback to the applicant during the interview (even just 'great' or 'really good'). Say "thank you" instead.

- ▪ 'Chemistry' or 'fit' impressions

Rank Order Discussions:
- ▪ Consider the use of applicant initials rather than full names for the discussion of candidates.

Useful Resources:

1. [AAMC Best Practices for Conducting Residency Program Interviews](#)
2. [AAIM Recommendations to promote equity and inclusion in the internal medicine interview process. (Am J Med 2022)](#)
3. [AAMC Virtual Interview Guide: Tips for program directors](#)
4. [AAMC Virtual interview tips for interviewers](#)
5. [Avoiding the virtual pitfall: Identifying and mitigating biases in graduate medical education videoconference interviews. Academic Medicine 2021;96:1120-1124.](#)

Appendix 1: The Effects of Components of Structure on Reliability, Validity, Fairness, and Applicant Reactions

Note: "positive" means overall positive effect, "negative" means overall negative effect, and "not enough research" means insufficient research on the effect of the enhancement. "Reliability" refers the extent to which the evaluation process is consistent and candidate responses are evaluated consistently. "Validity" refers to the accuracy of inferences made from interview scores.

Content	Reliability	Validity	Fairness	Applicant Reactions
Ask questions that are job-related	not enough research	positive	positive	positive
Ask all applicants questions that cover the same topics	positive	positive	positive	not enough research
Limit probing questions	positive	positive	positive	negative
Use behavioral or situational questions	positive	positive	positive	not enough research
Use a longer interview	positive	positive	not enough research	negative
Have no access to applicant information before or during interview	positive	not enough research	positive	negative
Have applicants not ask any questions	positive	not enough research	not enough research	negative
Rate each answer or use multiple rating scales	positive	positive	not enough research	not enough research
Use defined rating scales	positive	positive	positive	not enough research
Take detailed notes	positive	positive	positive	not enough research
Use multiple interviewers	positive	positive	positive	negative
Use the same interviewers for all applicants	positive	not enough research	negative	not enough research
Have no discussion between interviews	negative	not enough research	positive	not enough research
Train interviewers	positive	positive	positive	positive
Use formulas to create interview total scores	positive	positive	positive	not enough research

Source: Adapted from Campion et al. (1997) and Levashina et al. (2014).

Appendix 2: Implicit Bias Resources

Implicit bias is a form of bias that occurs automatically, and unintentionally, and affects our judgments, decisions, and behaviours. We all have biases; the key is to mitigate the effect on our perceptions of applicants during the resident selection process.

Resources:

Project Implicit has a variety of short 'tests' (i.e., gender). The test takes approximately 3 – 5 minutes. Take a test: https://www.projectimplicit.net/

Royal Society video on implicit bias:
https://royalsociety.org/topics-policy/publications/2015/unconscious-bias/

A practical approach to implicit bias training.
https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC8370365/

Sixteen unconscious bias examples and how to avoid them in the workplace.
Unconscious Bias: What It Is and How To Avoid It (With Examples) | Built In

Appendix 3: Interview Questions

The purpose of the interview is to identify the personal characteristics that will make an applicant successful in your specific program. Structured interviews are designed to improved reliability and validity by increasing standardization.

1. **Content-related components:**

   - standardization of the interview content
   - asking job-related questions
   - asking all applicants, the same questions

2. **Evaluation-related:**
   - increasing standardization of the evaluation process, which includes rating scales, implicit bias training, and independent scoring.

Types of questions to use when possible:

1. *Behavioral questions* **– (past behavior predicts future behavior)**
   - These questions look at the past – what the applicant did in a specific situation or context related to their future role as a resident.
   - Examples include: 'Please describe a time when…'

2. *Situational questions* **– (intentions predict future behavior)**
   - These questions are focused on the future –how would the applicant would react to a hypothetical situation?
   - Examples include:
     - 'What would you do if…?'
     - 'How would you deal with…?'
     - 'Imagine (situation) …. What would you do?'

Caution - Do <u>NOT</u> ask:
X Any questions or information about other applicants or ranking, or a plan for an applicant's ranking.

X Do not provide any information about the program intent regarding ranking. Rank order lists are confidential and are not to be shared at any point.

X Do not ask any questions prohibited by Human Rights legislation. A list of inappropriate questions is available [here](#).